



European Association for
Quality Assurance in Higher Education

Prof. Dr. Abdumutalip Abzhapparov
President
Kazakhstan Association for Modern (Elite) Education (KAZSEE)
24 Koktem 3 microdistrict
050040 Almaty
Kazakhstan

Brussels, 12 July 2023

Subject: Statement on validation of the external review report of KAZSEE

Dear . Dr. Abdumutalip Abzhapparov,

I am pleased to inform you that, at its meeting on 28 June 2023, the ENQA Agency Review Committee validated the external review report of KAZSEE. The committee concluded that the report has been produced in accordance with the Guidelines for ENQA Agency Reviews and can thus be used to apply for ENQA membership and EQAR registration, as well as for any other purposes. This is in line with article 26, paragraph 2 of ENQA's Rules of Procedure, which states that the review report can be further used only once this statement of validation has been issued. The purpose of this statement is to set out the committee's views on the quality of the final report and consistency of the panel's evaluation on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG).

The committee received the final review report that addressed the additional requirements as elaborated in the committee's letter to the panel dated 2 May 2023. Furthermore, the committee made the following observation regarding the final review report. On the ESG 2.3 Implementing processes, the committee found the agency to be partially compliant with the standard due to no follow-up in place for the agency's external quality assurance activities.

The committee received the final review report that addressed the additional requirements. The final review report can thus be further used to apply for ENQA membership and EQAR registration, as well as for any other purposes, as stipulated above.

This statement will be published on ENQA's website as an annex to the review report.



European Association for
Quality Assurance in Higher Education

Thank you for your trust placed in ENQA to conduct this review. If you have any further queries, please do not hesitate to contact the ENQA Secretariat.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Alastair Delaney', is written over a light blue horizontal line.

Mr. Alastair Delaney
Chair of ENQA Agency Review Committee

Annex: Areas for development

Annex: Areas for development

As outlined by the review panel and further discussed by the committee (where relevant), KAZSEE is recommended to take appropriate action, in so far as it is empowered to do so, on the following issues:

ESG 3.1 Activities, policy, and processes for quality assurance

The strategy plan should reflect the goals and objectives of KAZSEE and the plan for achieving these goals including indicators.

The agency is recommended to formalise the processes of risk identification and development of possible actions.

The agency is recommended to strengthen the formal involvement of stakeholders in the work of the agency.

ESG 3.3 Independence

The agency is recommended to ensure the operational independence and the independence of formal outcomes in accordance with the legal documents by giving up the membership of the President and Vice-president in KAZSEE Supervisory Board and the AC so that decisions are made without risks of conflict of interest.

ESG 3.4 Thematic analysis

The agency is recommended to develop understanding about the purpose of producing thematic analysis.

The agency is recommended to make plans for thematic analysis and involve the stakeholders.

The agency is recommended to share and publish the thematic analyses.

ESG 3.5 Resources

The agency is recommended to consider employing more staff, especially coordinators with further expansion of the activities.

The agency is recommended to increase proficiency of the KAZSEE staff in the English language for international project and accreditation activities.

The agency is recommended to improve its website and ensure the capacity to hold all the reports, speed of connection and active links.

ESG 3.6 Internal quality assurance and professional conduct

The agency is recommended to develop and implement more formalised and systematic feedback on the accreditation procedures.

The agency is recommended to develop and publish a QA policy on the agency's website.

ESG 2.1 Consideration of internal quality assurance

The agency is recommended to systematically analyse the policy for quality assurance in PA.

ESG 2.2 Designing methodologies fit for purpose

The agency is recommended to apply more wider structured consultations which would ensure involvement of all stakeholder groups into the design of accreditation documents.

ESG 2.3 Implementing processes

The agency is recommended to include the follow-up procedure in the methodology as well as the procedure guidelines. The procedure should be clearly communicated to HEIs.

ESG 2.4 Peer-review experts

The agency is recommended to spread information about the possibility for students to be involved as experts in KAZSEE accreditation processes.

The agency is recommended to consider a guide and instruction to new student experts as well as student's member of the AC.

ESG 2.6 Reporting

The agency is recommended to publish AC decisions together with the reports on the agency's website.

The agency is recommended to promote and highlight the reports and the Award of EUR-ACE Label.

The agency is recommended to ensure that all reports from KAZSEE accreditation procedures would be publicly available.

The agency is recommended to include the information about former decisions and the fulfilment of previous recommendations in the new report template.

ESG 2.7 Complaints and appeals

The agency is recommended to ensure participation of the students in the Appeals Commission.